

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
NATIONAL OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC ADMINISTRATION**

**In The Federal Consistency Appeal of Millennium Pipeline Company, L.P.
From an Objection by the New York State Department of State
Pursuant To The Coastal Zone Management Act**

**AMICUS BRIEF
OF THE VILLAGE OF CROTON-ON-HUDSON, NEW YORK
AND PUBLIC COMMENTS
OF THE VILLAGE OF BRIARCLIFF MANOR, NEW YORK**

Neil L. Levy, Esq.
Christian C. Semonsen, Esq.
KIRKLAND & ELLIS
655 Fifteenth Street, NW
Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20005

Counsel for The Villages of Croton-
on-Hudson and Briarcliff Manor,
New York

October 23, 2002

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Opening Statement.....	1
II.	The NYSDOS Objection Was Timely Because (1) Millennium Agreed To Extend the Review Period And (2) Any Delays Were The Result Of Millennium's Own Actions.	6
A.	Millennium Agreed To Extend The Review Period.	7
B.	The Delays Were The Result Of Millennium's Own Actions.	10
III.	Ground I -- The Secretary Should Uphold The NYSDOS Objection Because The Millennium Pipeline Is Not Consistent With The Objectives Or Purposes Of The CZMA.	14
A.	<u>Preliminary Matter</u> -- Millennium's Reliance On FERC Is Misplaced.	15
B.	<u>Element 1</u> -- The Millennium Pipeline Does Not Further Any Of The National Interests Articulated In The CZMA In A Significant And Substantial Manner.	17
1.	The CZMA Does Not Support Millennium's Assertion That The "Siting Of Energy Facilities" <i>Per Se</i> Furthers The National Interest.....	17
2.	Millennium's Project Is Not Necessary To Meet The Nation's Energy Needs.	20
3.	The Pipeline Will Not Serve To Promote "Compatible Economic Development" Of The Coastal Zone.....	27
4.	The Pipeline Will Not Protect And Enhance Coastal Zone Resources.	28
C.	<u>Element 2</u> -- The Project's Impacts on Haverstraw Bay, The Village's Well Field, The Jane E. Lytle Memorial Arboretum, And Other Coastal Resources Are Significant; Any Purported Benefits Do Not Outweigh These Adverse Impacts.	29
1.	The Pipeline Will Have an Adverse Impact on Haverstraw Bay.....	29
a.	Description of Haverstraw Bay.....	30
b.	Millennium's Dredging Will Harm The Bay.....	31
c.	Millennium's Blasting Techniques Will Harm The Bay.	33
2.	The Village Wellfield And Arboretum Are Important Coastal Resources Meriting Protection Under the CZMA.	35
3.	The Impacts of the Pipeline on the Village's Wellfield Will Be Substantial, And The Risk To Public Drinking Water Supplies Outweighs The Potential Benefits Of This Route.....	37
4.	The Pipeline Would Permanently Alter The Jane E. Lytle Memorial Arboretum And Threaten The Viability Of Its Wetland.	44
5.	The Proposed Crossing Of The Catskill Aqueduct Poses An Unacceptable And Unnecessary Risk To New York City's Drinking Water Supply.	47
6.	Millennium Must Balance Development And Environmental Goals.	48

D. Element 3 -- There Are Several Alternatives To The Proposed Pipeline That Would Serve The Purposes Of The Project In A Manner Consistent With The CZMA.....49

1. The Palisades/Dobbs Ferry Alternative 151

2. The Palisades/Dobbs Ferry Alternative 256

3. Clarkstown/Route 117 Alternative58

4. Hudson River North Alternatives 1 and 2.....61

5. Navigation Channel Alternative65

6. Terminate The Pipeline At Bowline Point.....67

7. Directional Drill of Haverstraw Bay.....69

8. Partial Directional Drill of Haverstraw Bay71

9. System Alternatives72

10. Westchester Upland Alternatives.....74

IV. Ground II – Upholding The NYSDOS Decision Will Not Result In Any Significant Impairment Of National Security Interests.77

V. Conclusion82